Voting Methods Contemporary Math

Josh Engwer

TTU

15 July 2015

In free societies, citizens **vote** for politicians whose values & opinions on contemporary issues align with theirs.

Unfortunately, voting is not as clear-cut as one would expect. Consider U.S. presidential elections:

- 2000 Face-Off [Al Gore (D) vs George W. Bush (R)]:
 - Gore received more (popular) votes than Bush, yet Bush won!
 - Bush received more **electoral votes** and carried more states than Gore.
- 2012 Florida (R) Primary [Romney vs Gingrich vs Paul vs Santorum]:
 - $\bullet\,$ Mitt Romney earned all 50 delegates yet he earned < 50% of the votes.
 - Newt Gingrich earned no delegates yet he earned 32% of the votes.
- After a few primaries, most candidates drop out before most citizens have a chance to vote due to lack of funding.
- Winning depends not only on vote counts but also on how the votes are used!

Because of these issues, several voting methods exist.

Preference Ballots & Tables

Suppose there are five candidates: A,B,C,D,E

Each voter uses a **preference ballot** to rank the candidates:

1 <i>st</i>	D
2 nd	В
3 ^{<i>rd</i>}	Е
4 ^{<i>th</i>}	А
5 th	С

Identical preference ballots are grouped together in a preference table:

	Number of Ballots					
Preference	8	3	6	7	2	
1 <i>st</i>	Α	E	В	Α	D	
2 nd	В	D	D	С	В	
3 rd	С	A	С	Е	Е	
4 th	D	В	Е	В	Α	
5 th	E	С	Α	D	С	

The simplest, most intuitive voting method is the Plurality Method:

Definition	
(Plurality Metho	od)
SETUP:	Single-Winner Election has k candidates
PROCESS:	Each voter votes for one candidate
WINNER:	Candidate receiving the most votes

Plurality Method is typically used by:

- State elections
- Local elections
 - City council elections
 - School board elections

WEX 11-1-1: Using Plurality Method, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А

WEX 11-1-1: Using Plurality Method, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	A	D	B	С	В
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А

With Plurality Method, only the first choice matters (in blue)

Plurality Method (Example)

WEX 11-1-1: Using Plurality Method, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	A	D	B	C	В
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А

With Plurality Method, only the first choice matters (in blue)

A has	10	votes
B has	5 + 4 = 9	votes
C has	5	votes
D has	7	votes

Plurality Method (Example)

WEX 11-1-1: Using Plurality Method, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots					
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	
1 st choice	Α	D	B	C	B	
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С	
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D	
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А	

With Plurality Method, only the first choice matters (in blue)

A has	10	votes
B has	5 + 4 = 9	votes
C has	5	votes
D has	7	votes

Since A has the most votes, A is the winner

Borda Count Method (Definition)

What if, instead, voters must rank each candidate?

Definition	
(Borda Count Met	nod)
SETUP:	Single-Winner Election has k candidates
PROCESS: (1)	Each voter ranks all candidates as follows: The 1 st choice receives k points The 2 nd choice receives $(k - 1)$ points The 3 rd choice receives $(k - 2)$ points
(2)	The last choice receives 1 point For each candidate, compute the total sum of points
WINNER:	Candidate receiving the most total points
	od is typically used in: nusic industry awards, hiring CEO's,

Josh Engwer (TTU)

Voting Methods

	Number of Ballots					
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В	
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С	
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D	
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А	

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice/4	Α	D	В	С	В
2 nd choice/3	С	В	С	D	С
3 rd choice/2	В	Α	Α	Α	D
4 th choice/1	D	С	D	В	А

Assign points to each preference catagory (in blue)

		Number of Ballots						
Preference	10	7	5	5	4			
1^{st} choice/4	$A/(4 \times 10)$	$D/(4 \times 7)$	$B/(4 \times 5)$	$C/(4 \times 5)$	$B/(4 \times 4)$			
2^{nd} choice/3	$C/(3 \times 10)$	$B/(3 \times 7)$	$C/(3 \times 5)$	$D/(3 \times 5)$	$C/(3 \times 4)$			
3 rd choice/2	$B/(2 \times 10)$	$A/(2 \times 7)$	$A/(2 \times 5)$	$A/(2 \times 5)$	$D/(2 \times 4)$			
4^{th} choice/1	$D/(1 \times 10)$	$C/(1 \times 7)$	$D/(1 \times 5)$	$B/(1 \times 5)$	$A/(1 \times 4)$			

Assign points to each choice

	Number of Ballots					
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	
1 st choice/4	A /40	D/28	B /20	C /20	B/16	
2 nd choice/3	C /30	B /21	C /15	D/15	C /12	
3 rd choice/2	B /20	A /14	A /10	A /10	D/8	
4 th choice/1	D/10	C /7	D/5	B/5	A /4	

Assign points to each choice (and simplify)

	Number of Ballots					
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	
1 st choice/4	A/40	D/28	B /20	C /20	B /16	
2 nd choice/3	C /30	B /21	C /15	D/15	C /12	
3 rd choice/2	B /20	<i>A</i> /14	A/10	A/10	D/8	
4 th choice/1	D/10	C /7	D/5	B/5	A/4	

Tally points for each candidate:

A: 40 + 14 + 10 + 10 + 4 = 78 points

	Number of Ballots					
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	
1 st choice/4	A /40	D/28	<i>B</i> /20	C /20	<i>B</i> /16	
2^{nd} choice/3	C /30	<i>B</i> /21	C /15	D/15	C /12	
3 rd choice/2	<i>B</i> /20	A /14	A /10	A /10	D/8	
4^{th} choice/1	D/10	C /7	D/5	<i>B</i> /5	A /4	

Tally points for each candidate:

A: 40 + 14 + 10 + 10 + 4 = 78 points

$$B: 20 + 21 + 20 + 5 + 16 = 82$$
 points

	Number of Ballots					
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	
1 st choice/4	A /40	D/28	B/20	<i>C</i> /20	B /16	
2 nd choice/3	<i>C</i> /30	B /21	<i>C</i> /15	D/15	<i>C</i> /12	
3 rd choice/2	B /20	A /14	A /10	A /10	D/8	
4 th choice/1	D/10	<i>C</i> /7	D/5	B/5	A /4	

Tally points for each candidate:

- A: 40 + 14 + 10 + 10 + 4 = 78 points
- B: 20 + 21 + 20 + 5 + 16 = 82 points

C: 30 + 7 + 15 + 20 + 12 = 84 points

Borda Count Method (Example)

WEX 11-1-2: Using Borda Count Method, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots					
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	
1 st choice/4	A /40	<i>D</i> /28	B/20	C /20	B /16	
2 nd choice/3	C /30	B/21	C /15	<i>D</i> /15	C /12	
3 rd choice/2	B /20	A /14	A /10	A /10	D /8	
4^{th} choice/1	<i>D</i> /10	C /7	<i>D</i> /5	B/5	A /4	

Tally points for each candidate:

- A: 40 + 14 + 10 + 10 + 4 = 78 points
- B: 20 + 21 + 20 + 5 + 16 = 82 points

C:
$$30 + 7 + 15 + 20 + 12 = 84$$
 points

D: 10+28+5+15+8=52 points

Borda Count Method (Example)

WEX 11-1-2: Using Borda Count Method, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots					
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	
1 st choice/4	A /40	D/28	B/20	C /20	B /16	
2^{nd} choice/3	C /30	B /21	C /15	D/15	C /12	
3 rd choice/2	B /20	A /14	A /10	A /10	D/8	
4 th choice/1	D/10	C /7	D/5	B/5	A /4	

Tally points for each candidate:

- A: 40 + 14 + 10 + 10 + 4 = 78 points
- B: 20 + 21 + 20 + 5 + 16 = 82 points
- C: 30 + 7 + 15 + 20 + 12 = 84 points

D: 10 + 28 + 5 + 15 + 8 = 52 points

Since Candidate C has the most points, C is the winner

Definition

(Plurality-with-Elimination Method)

- SETUP: Single-Winner Election has *k* candidates
- PROCESS: (0) Compute total votes & # votes needed for a majority
 - If no candidate receives a majority of votes, then drop candidate(s) with fewest votes from the ballot
 - (2) Conduct a new election round with updated ballot Assume voters <u>don't</u> change their preferences each round^{*}
 - (3) Repeat (1)-(2) until a candidate receives a majority

WINNER: Candidate receiving a **majority of votes**

*If voters prefer A to B and B to C, then if B's dropped, voters will prefer A to C. Plurality-with-Elimination Method is typically used in:

Municipal Elections (e.g. city mayor)

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А

WEX 11-1-3: Using Plurality-with-Elimination Mtd, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А

First of all, compute the total votes & votes needed for majority:

Total votes = 10 + 7 + 5 + 5 + 4 = 31 $31/2 = 15.5 \implies$ At least 16 votes needed for a majority

WEX 11-1-3: Using Plurality-with-Elimination Mtd, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А

Total votes = 31

At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Round 1

WEX 11-1-3: Using Plurality-with-Elimination Mtd, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	A	D	B	С	В
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А

Total votes = 31 At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Count 1st-choice votes for each candidate:

A =	10	< 16	\implies (NOT a majority)
B =	5 + 4 = 9	< 16	\implies (NOT a majority)
C =	5	< 16	\implies (NOT a majority)
D =	7	< 16	\implies (NOT a majority)

WEX 11-1-3: Using Plurality-with-Elimination Mtd, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А

Total votes = 31

At least 16 votes needed for a majority

24 / 49

Count 1st-choice votes for each candidate:

- $A = 10 < 16 \implies (\text{NOT a majority})$
- $B = 5 + 4 = 9 < 16 \implies (\text{NOT a majority})$
- C = $5 < 16 \implies (\text{NOT a majority})$
- D =7 < 16 \implies (NOT a majority)

Since no candidate has a majority, eliminate candidate(s) with fewest votes: C Josh Engwer (TTU) Voting Methods 15 July 2015

	Number of Ballots					
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В	
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С	
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D	
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А	

Total votes = 31 At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Since no candidate has a majority, eliminate candidate(s) with fewest votes: C

	Number of Ballots					
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В	
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С	
3 rd choice	B	Α	Α	Α	D	
4 th choice	D	С	D	B	Α	

Total votes = 31 At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Eliminate candidate C, moving every entry below C (in blue) up one row

	Number of Ballots					
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	
1 st choice	Α	D	В	D	В	
2 nd choice	B	В	Α	Α	D	
3 rd choice	D	Α	D	B	Α	
4 th choice						

Total votes = 31 At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Eliminate candidate C, moving every entry below C (in blue) up one row

WEX 11-1-3: Using Plurality-with-Elimination Mtd, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	Α	D	В	D	В
2 nd choice	В	В	Α	Α	D
3 rd choice	D	Α	D	В	А

Total votes = 31

At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Round 2

WEX 11-1-3: Using Plurality-with-Elimination Mtd, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	A	D	B	D	В
2 nd choice	В	В	Α	Α	D
3 rd choice	D	Α	D	В	А

Total votes = 31

At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Count 1st-choice votes for each candidate:

 $A = 10 < 16 \implies (\text{NOT a majority})$ $B = 5 + 4 = 9 < 16 \implies (\text{NOT a majority})$ $D = 7 + 5 = 12 < 16 \implies (\text{NOT a majority})$

WEX 11-1-3: Using Plurality-with-Elimination Mtd, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	Α	D	В	D	В
2 nd choice	В	B	Α	Α	D
3 rd choice	D	Α	D	B	А

Total votes = 31 At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Count 1st-choice votes for each candidate:

A =	10	< 16	\implies (NOT a majority)
B =	5 + 4 = 9	< 16	\implies (NOT a majority)
D =	7 + 5 = 12	< 16	\implies (NOT a majority)

Since no candidate has a majority, eliminate candidate(s) with fewest votes: B

WEX 11-1-3: Using Plurality-with-Elimination Mtd, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	Α	D	В	D	В
2 nd choice	В	В	Α	Α	D
3 rd choice	D	Α	D	B	А

Total votes = 31

At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Since no candidate has a majority, eliminate candidate(s) with fewest votes: B

WEX 11-1-3: Using Plurality-with-Elimination Mtd, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	Α	D	B	D	В
2 nd choice	В	B	Α	Α	D
3 rd choice	D	Α	D	B	Α

Total votes = 31

At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Eliminate candidate B, moving every entry below B (in blue) up one row

WEX 11-1-3: Using Plurality-with-Elimination Mtd, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	Α	D	A	D	D
2 nd choice	D	Α	D	Α	Α
3 rd choice					

Total votes = 31

At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Eliminate candidate B, moving every entry below B (in blue) up one row

	Number of Ballots				
Preference	10	7	5	5	4
1 st choice	Α	D	Α	D	D
2 nd choice	D	Α	D	Α	Α

Total votes = 31 At least 16 votes needed for a majority Round 3

	Number of Ballots						
Preference	10	7	5	5	4		
1 st choice	Α	D	Α	D	D		
2 nd choice	D	Α	D	Α	Α		

Total votes = 31 At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Count 1st-choice votes for each candidate:

$$A = 10 + 5 = 15 < 16 \implies (\text{NOT a majority})$$
$$D = 7 + 5 + 4 = 16 \ge 16 \implies (\text{MAJORITY!})$$

WEX 11-1-3: Using Plurality-with-Elimination Mtd, determine election winner:

	Number of Ballots						
Preference	10	7	5	5	4		
1 st choice	Α	D	Α	D	D		
2 nd choice	D	Α	D	Α	А		

Total votes = 31 At least 16 votes needed for a majority

Count 1st-choice votes for each candidate:

 $A = 10 + 5 = 15 < 16 \implies (\text{NOT a majority})$

 $D = 7 + 5 + 4 = 16 \ge 16 \implies (\mathsf{MAJORITY!})$

Since candidate D has a majority, D is the winner

Pairwise Comparison Method (Definition)

The election winner is expected to beat each candidate "head-to-head":

Definition		
(Pairwise Con	nparis	on Method)
SETUP:		Single-Winner Election has k candidates
PROCESS:	(1) (2) (3)	Voters rank all candidates Pit candidates A and B "head-to-head" Count how many voters prefer A to B Count how many voters prefer B to A If A and B are tied, then each receives 1/2 point Else the more preferred candidate receives 1 point and the less preferred candidate receives 0 points Repeat Step (2) for each pair of candidates
WINNER:		Candidate receiving the most points

Pairwise Comparison Method is typically used in Sports Drafts.

Josh Engwer (T	τu
----------------	----

# CANDIDATES	TOTAL # PAIRWISE COMPARISONS
3	3
4	6
5	10
6	15
7	21
8	28
9	36
10	45
15	105
20	190
50	1225
100	4950

	Number of Ballots								
Preference	10	7	5	5	4				
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В				
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С				
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D				
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А				

	Nu	mbe	er of	i Ba	llots	CANDIDATE	DOINTS	
Preference	10	7	5	5	4		FUINTS	
1 st choice	A	D	B	С	B	A	1	
2 nd choice	С	B	С	D	С	В	1	
3 rd choice	B	A	Α	Α	D			
4 th choice	D	С	D	B	Α	D		

A versus B:

$$A = 10 + 5 = 15$$

 $B = 7 + 5 + 4 = 16 \leftarrow WINNER!$

	Nu	mbe	er of	i Ba	llots	CANDIDATE	DOINTS	
Preference	10	7	5	5	4		FUINTS	
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В	A	l	
2 nd choice	C	В	C	D	С	В	1	
3 rd choice	В	A	A	A	D	C		
4 th choice	D	C		B	4	D		
4 Choice		C		D	A			

A versus C:

 $A = 10 + 7 = 17 \leftarrow WINNER!$ C = 5 + 5 + 4 = 14

	Nu	mbe	er of	i Ba	llots	CANDIDATE	DOINTS	
Preference	10	7	5	5	4		FUINTS	
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В	A	1	
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	C	В	1	
3 rd choice	B	A	A	A		С		
5 Choice	D	A	A	A	D	П	1	
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	Α		1	

A versus D:

$$A = 10 + 5 = 15$$

 $D = 7 + 5 + 4 = 16 \leftarrow WINNER!$

	Nu	mbe	er of	i Ba	llots	CANDIDATE	DOINTS	
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	CANDIDATE	FUINTS	
1 st choice	Α	D	B	С	В	A	1	
2 nd choice	C	B			C	B	2	
	C	D	C		C	С		
3 rd choice	B	A	A	Α	D		1	
4 th choice	D	С	D	B	Α		1	

B versus C:

 $B = 7 + 5 + 4 = 16 \leftarrow WINNER!$ C = 10 + 5 = 15

	Nu	mbe	er of	i Ba	llots	CANDIDATE	DOINTS	
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	CANDIDATE	FUINTS	
1 st choice	Α	D	B	С	В	A	I	
2^{nd} choice	C	B	C		C	B	3	
	-	_	-	D	U	С		
3 rd choice	B	A	A	Α	D		1	
4 th choice	D	C	D	B	Α		1	

B versus D:

 $B = 10 + 5 + 4 = 19 \leftarrow WINNER!$ D = 7 + 5 = 12

	Nu	mbe	er of	i Ba	llots	CANDIDATE	DOINTS	
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	CANDIDATE	FUINTS	
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В	A	1	
2 nd choice	C		-		-	B	3	
	C	В	C	D	C	С	1	
3 rd choice	В	A	A	Α	D		1	
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	Α		1	
3 rd choice 4 th choice		A <i>C</i>			D A	D	1	

C versus D: $C = 10 + 5 + 5 + 4 = 24 \leftarrow \text{WINNER!}$ D = 7

	Nu	mbe	er of	Ba	llots		DOINTO	
Preference	10	7	5	5	4	CANDIDATE	POINTS	$\frac{1}{2}$ -POINTS
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В	A	l	
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С	B	3	
3 rd choice	В	A	Α	Α	D	C	1	
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	Α	D	1	

Since candidate B has the most points, B is the winner

Summary of the Previous Examples

	Number of Ballots								
Preference	10	7	5	5	4				
1 st choice	Α	D	В	С	В				
2 nd choice	С	В	С	D	С				
3 rd choice	В	Α	Α	Α	D				
4 th choice	D	С	D	В	А				

EXAMPLE	VOTING METHOD	WINNER
WEX 11-1-1	Plurality	Α
WEX 11-1-2	Borda Count	С
WEX 11-1-3	Plurality+Elimination	D
WEX 11-1-4	Pairwise Comparisons	В

As this shows, it's possible for each method to determine a different winner of the same election.

Voter Apathy & Alternative Voting Methods

Definition

(Voter Apathy)

Voter apathy is the belief that one's vote does not count.

Some voter apathy is caused by frustration with the Plurality Method.

In response to voter apathy, alternative voting methods have been proposed:

Approval Voting Voters vote for as many candidates as they want

	Voters rank candidates
	Weakest candidate is eliminated
Instant Runoff Voting	If eliminated candidate was a voter's 1 st choice,
-	then that candidate becomes voter's 2 nd choice
	(i.e vote was not wasted)

Such alternative voting methods are beyond the scope of this course.

Fin.